# THE ADAMS SPECTRAL SEQUENCE FOR 3-LOCAL tmf 

D. CULVER


#### Abstract

The purpose of this short article is to record the computation for 3-local tmf via the Adams spectral sequence.


## Contents

1. Introduction ..... 1
1.1. Outline of the paper ..... 2
2. The mod 3 homology of tmf ..... 3
3. Computing the cohomology of $\Gamma$ ..... 4
4. Determining the Adams $E_{2}$-term ..... 6
4.1. algebraic differentials ..... 7
4.2. algebraic $E_{\infty}$-term ..... 9
4.3. algebraic hidden extensions ..... 11
4.4. comparison to the Adams spectral sequence in tmf-modules ..... 15
5. Adams differentials ..... 16
5.1. Adams $d_{2}$-differentials ..... 16
5.2. Determining the Adams $E_{3}$-term ..... 21
5.3. Higher Adams differentials ..... 26
5.4. Hidden extensions ..... 29
References ..... 33

## 1. Introduction

In this paper, we will carry out a computation of the homotopy groups of tmf. The homotopy groups of tmf have been known for quite awhile now. For example, the computation of $\pi_{*} \operatorname{tmf}$ was explicitly written up in [1], though it was known even earlier to Hopkins and his collaborators (cf. [6]). The usual approach to calculating $\pi_{*}$ tmf is via the Adams-Novikov spectral sequence (also referred to as the descent spectral sequence in this context). One
advantage of this approach is that the Adams-Novikov $E_{2}$-term can be computed using the theory of elliptic curves.

However, there are occasions where one wants to know the Adams spectral sequence for computing the homotopy groups of a spectrum. That is, one may want to know the Adams $E_{2}$-term, all differentials, and all hidden extensions. The purpose of this paper is to record the Adams spectral sequence for 3-local topological modular forms.

The reader may wonder why one would be interested in knowing the Adams spectral sequence for tmf, especially since the AdamsNovikov spectral sequence is far more efficient for this purpose. We should mention that the analogous calculation at the prime 2 is being carried out by Rognes and Bruner ([2]). It is the author's understanding that their interest in that spectral sequence stemmed from their work on the topological Hochschild homology of tmf. We speculate knowing the Adams spectral sequence at the prime 3 might be useful for similar reasons.
1.1. Outline of the paper. Recall that the Adams spectral sequence is a convergent spectral sequence of the form

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}, H_{*} \operatorname{tmf}\right) \Longrightarrow \pi_{*} \operatorname{tmf}_{3}^{\wedge}
$$

Thus, a necessary input is $H_{*}$ tmf. This was determined, for example, in [9], where Rezk shows there is a short exact sequence of comodules

$$
0 \rightarrow \Sigma^{8} \mathcal{B} \rightarrow H_{*} \operatorname{tmf} \rightarrow \mathcal{B} \rightarrow 0
$$

where $\mathcal{B}$ is a certain subalgebra of the dual Steenrod algebra $A_{*}$. This is the starting point of our calculation. We view this short exact sequence as giving a multiplicative filtration of $H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$ by comodules, yielding an algebraic spectral sequence

$$
E_{1}^{*, *, *}=\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}\left(E_{0} H_{*} \operatorname{tmf}\right) \cong \operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}(\mathcal{B}) \otimes E\left(b_{4}\right) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}\left(H_{*} \operatorname{tmf}\right)
$$

In $\$ 2$ we recall these details and establish a change-of-rings formula for $\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}(\mathcal{B})$. In $\S 3$ we use a Cartan-Eilenberg spectral sequence to compute $\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}(\mathcal{B})$. An expert in these affairs can safely ignore this section. In $\$ 4$, we determine the Adams $E_{2}$-term. Finally, in $\$ 5$, we establish the Adams differentials and derive $\pi_{*}$ tmf.

Conventions. In this article, we will implicitly assume that all spectra are 3-complete. Thus tmf refers, from here on out, to the 3completion of the spectrum of topological modular forms. We will always denote mod 3 Eilenberg-MacLane spectrum by $H$. Given a Hopf algebra $\Gamma$ and a comodule $C$ over $\Gamma$, we will abbreviate $\operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}, C\right)$ by $\operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}(C)$. In the case when $\Gamma=A_{*}$, we will write $\operatorname{Ext}(C)$. We will always employ Adams indexing unless specifically stated otherwise. We let $\zeta_{n}$ denote $\chi \xi_{n}$ and $\bar{\tau}_{n}$ denote $\chi \tau_{n}$ in the dual Steenrod algebra.

Acknowledgements. The author would like to thank Mark Behrens for encouraging him to write up this computation. He would also like to thank Hood Chatham for creating such a wonderful LATEXpackage for drawing spectral sequences as well as for assistance in drawing some of the charts in this paper.

## 2. The mod 3 homology of tmf

In this section we recall necessary facts about the mod 3 homology of tmf. In [9], it is shown that, as an algebra, the homology of tmf is given by

$$
H_{*} \operatorname{tmf} \cong E\left(b_{4}\right) \otimes \mathcal{B}
$$

where $\left|b_{4}\right|=8$ and

$$
\mathcal{B}:=\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[\zeta_{1}^{3}, \zeta_{n} \mid n \geq 2\right] \otimes E\left(\bar{\tau}_{n} \mid n \geq 3\right)
$$

One can easily check that $\mathcal{B}$ is a comodule algebra over $A_{*}$. Furthermore, Rezk shows that there is nontrivial extension of comodules

$$
\begin{equation*}
0 \longrightarrow \Sigma^{8} \mathcal{B} \longrightarrow H_{*} \operatorname{tmf} \longrightarrow \mathcal{B} \rightarrow 0 \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Applying Ext ${ }_{A_{*}}(-)$ to this short exact sequence of comodules yields a long exact sequence in Ext. We regard this as a convergent spectral sequence

$$
\operatorname{Ext}\left(\Sigma^{8} \mathcal{B}\right) \oplus \operatorname{Ext}(\mathcal{B}) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}\left(H_{*} \operatorname{tmf}\right)
$$

The fact that 2.1 is a nontrivial extension implies that this spectral sequence does not immediately collapse. Determining the differentials in this spectral sequence is the subject of section 4 . Thus, it is apparent that we need to compute the Ext groups of $\mathcal{B}$. We will simplify this by establishing a change-of-rings formula.

Definition 2.2. Let $\Gamma$ be the Hopf algebra

$$
\Gamma:=\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[\zeta_{1}\right] /\left(\zeta_{1}^{3}\right) \otimes E\left(\bar{\tau}_{0}, \bar{\tau}_{1}, \bar{\tau}_{2}\right)
$$

with the induced coproduct from the dual Steenrod algebra.
Example 2.3. In the dual Steenrod algebra, the coproduct on $\bar{\tau}_{2}$ is given by

$$
\psi\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)=\bar{\tau}_{2} \otimes 1+\bar{\tau}_{0} \otimes \zeta_{2}+\bar{\tau}_{1} \otimes \zeta_{1}^{3}+1 \otimes \bar{\tau}_{2}
$$

Thus, in $\Gamma, \bar{\tau}_{2}$ is a Hopf algebra primitive. On the other hand,

$$
\psi\left(\bar{\tau}_{1}\right)=\bar{\tau}_{1} \otimes 1+\bar{\tau}_{0} \otimes \zeta_{1}+1 \otimes \bar{\tau}_{1}
$$

Thus this Hopf algebra is not primitively generated..
The proof of the following proposition is standard.
Proposition 2.4. There is an isomorphism

$$
\mathcal{B} \cong A_{*} \square_{\Gamma} \mathbb{F}_{3}
$$

Corollary 2.5. There is a change-of-rings isomorphism

$$
\operatorname{Ext}(\mathcal{B}) \cong \operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)
$$

Thus we must compute the cohomology of the Hopf algebra $\Gamma$. This is done in the next section.

## 3. Computing the cohomology of $\Gamma$

In the last section we showed that the Ext groups of $\mathcal{B}$ are $\operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. Since $\Gamma$ is a finite Hopf algebra, there is hope of computing its cohomology. Recall that $A(1)$ is the subalgebra of the Steenrod algebra generated by the Bockstein $\beta$ and $\mathcal{P}^{1}$. Its dual is

$$
A(1)_{*} \cong \mathbb{F}_{3}\left[\zeta_{1}\right] /\left(\zeta_{1}^{3}\right) \otimes E\left(\bar{\tau}_{0}, \bar{\tau}_{1}\right) .
$$

In paticular, $A(1)_{*}$ is a sub-Hopf algebra of $\Gamma$. The following proposition relies on the material in the first appendix of [8]. We recommend the reader look at Definition A1.1.15. The following lemma is easily checked.

Lemma 3.1. The following

$$
A(1)_{*} \rightarrow \Gamma \rightarrow E\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)
$$

is a cocentral extension of Hopf algebras over $\mathbb{F}_{3}$.

When one has an extension of Hopf algebras, one can consider the Cartan-Eilenberg spectral sequence. In general, if

$$
(D, \Phi) \rightarrow(A, \Gamma) \rightarrow(A, \Sigma)
$$

is an extension of Hopf algebroids, $N$ is a left comodule over $\Gamma$, then there is a natural convergent spectral sequence of the form

$$
E_{2}^{f, s, t}=\operatorname{Ext}_{\Phi}^{f, t}\left(D, \operatorname{Ext}_{\Sigma}^{s}(A, N)\right) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}^{f+s, t}(A, N)
$$

Here, $f$ denotes the filtration degree and the differentials are of the form

$$
d_{r}: E_{r}^{f, s, t} \rightarrow E_{r}^{f+r, s-r+1, t}
$$

See A1.3.14 and A1.3.15 of [8] for details on this spectral sequence. Applied to our extension of Hopf algebras, this spectral sequence takes on the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
E_{2}^{f, s, t}=\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}^{f, t}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}, \operatorname{Ext}_{E\left(\tau_{2}\right)}^{s}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}, \mathbb{F}_{3}\right)\right) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}^{f+s, t}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Since $E\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)$ is a primitively generated exterior Hopf algebra, we have that

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{E\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cong \mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{2}\right]
$$

where the $(s, t)$-bidegree of $v_{2}$ is $(1,17)$. Note that since $\mathbb{F}_{3}$ is a comodule algebra, the Cartan-Eilenberg spectral sequence is multiplicative.

In order to determine the $E_{2}$-page of this spectral sequence, we need to understand the coaction of $A(1)_{*}$ on $\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{2}\right]$. As $\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{2}\right]$ is a comodule algebra over $A(1)_{*}$, it is enough to determine the coaction on $v_{2}$.

Lemma 3.3. Under the canonical $A(1)_{*}$-coaction on $\operatorname{Ext}_{E\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, the element $v_{2}$ is a comodule primitive.
Proof. Observe that the largest degree element of $A(1)_{*}$ is $\zeta_{1}^{2} \bar{\tau}_{0} \bar{\tau}_{1}$, which has degree 13. Since

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{E\left(\bar{\tau}_{2}\right)}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cong \mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{2}\right], \quad\left|v_{2}\right|=(1,17)
$$

the coaction on $v_{2}$ must be $1 \otimes v_{2}$ for degree reasons.
Corollary 3.4. The $E_{2}$-term of the Cartan-Eilenberg $S S$ is given by

$$
E_{2} \cong \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \otimes \mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{2}\right] .
$$

and the filtration degree of $v_{2}$ is 0 .
Thus we must determine the cohomology of $A(1)_{*}$. An elementary exercise in using the May spectral sequence (cf. [8]) will yield

Proposition 3.5. The algebra $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ is given by

$$
\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{0}, v_{1}^{3}, \beta\right] \otimes E\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right) /\left(v_{0} \alpha_{1}, v_{0} \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{1} \alpha_{2}-v_{0} \beta\right)
$$

where the $(s, t)$-bidegrees of the generators are given by

- $\left|\alpha_{1}\right|=(1,4)$
- $|\beta|=(2,12)$,
- $\left|\alpha_{2}\right|=(2,9)$

A chart for this Ext group is given below.


From now on, we will write $c_{6}$ for $v_{1}^{3}$. For degree reasons, this spectral sequence collapses. Thus we can infer the following.

Corollary 3.6. The cohomology of the Hopf algebra $\Gamma$ is given by

$$
\mathbb{F}_{3}\left[v_{0}, c_{6}, v_{2}, \beta\right] \otimes E\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right) /\left(v_{0} \alpha_{1}, v_{0} \alpha_{2}, h_{0} \alpha_{2}-v_{0} \beta\right) .
$$

## 4. Determining the Adams $E_{2}$-term

In this section we will determine the $E_{2}$-term of the Adams spectral sequence converging to $\pi_{*}$ tmf. The way this will be achieved is by applying the functor $\operatorname{Ext}(-)$ to the short exact sequence (2.1) to obtain a long exact sequence. Regarding this as a spectral sequence provides us with

$$
E_{1}=\operatorname{Ext}\left(\Sigma^{8} \mathcal{B}\right) \oplus \operatorname{Ext}(\mathcal{B}) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}(\operatorname{tmf})
$$

For the purposes of this paper, we will refer to this spectral sequence as the algebraic spectral sequence.
4.1. algebraic differentials. The results of the previous section show that, as an algebra, the $E_{1}$-term of the algebraic spectral sequence is given by

$$
E_{1}=\operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \otimes E\left(b_{4}\right)
$$

Since this is a spectral sequence derived from a long exact sequence, there can only be $d_{1}$-differentials. Note that in Adams indexing, the $d_{1}$-differential looks like an Adams $d_{1}$-differential. Results of the previous sections imply the following.

Lemma 4.1. The short exact sequence (2.1) gives a multiplicative filtration of $H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$ by $A_{*}$-comodules. Thus the algebraic spectral sequence is a multiplicative spectral sequence. Moreover, there is an isomorphism of $A_{*}$-comodule algebras

$$
E_{0} H_{*} \operatorname{tmf} \cong \mathcal{B} \otimes E\left(b_{4}\right)
$$

with $b_{4}$ a comodule primitive and has filtration degree 1. Thus

$$
E_{1} \cong \operatorname{Ext}_{\Gamma}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \otimes E\left(b_{4}\right)
$$

as a graded ring.
Below is a chart for the $E_{1}$-page of the algebraic spectral sequence. The classes in blue are those in the coset for $b_{4}$ in the $E_{1}$-page. In other words, they have filtration 1 with respect to the filtration on $H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$. Moreover, because the filtration on $H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$ only changes when going from the 0th filtration to the first filtration, this spectral sequence only has a $d^{1}$-differential. This differential is just the connecting homomorphism arising from the long exact sequence. In particular, this means that all differentials originate from a black class and target a blue class.

We will now determine the differentials in the algebraic spectral sequence. First, we make the following simple observation.

Lemma 4.2. For degree reasons, the classes $\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4}, \beta$, and $c_{6}$ are permanent cycles of the algebraic spectral sequence.

This observation and the multiplicativity of the spectral sequence eliminate many possible differentials.

From the known computation of $\pi_{*} \operatorname{tmf}$ (cf. [1]), we see that $\pi_{15} \mathrm{tmf}=0$. In the $E_{1}$-term of the algebraic spectral sequence, there are two classes in stem 15; the class $b_{4} \alpha_{2}$ and the class $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$. Both of these classes must die, but the multiplicativity of the spectral


Figure 4.1. The $E_{1}$ and $E_{2}$-page of the algebraic spectral sequence.
sequence implies that a differential must originate on $v_{2}$. The structure of the spectral sequence thus forces the following differential $]^{1}$

$$
d_{1}\left(v_{2}\right) \doteq b_{4} \alpha_{2}
$$

Multiplicativity of the spectral sequence and the previous lemma yields the following result.

Proposition 4.3. The algebraic spectral sequence has the following $d_{1}$ differentials

$$
d_{1}\left(v_{2}^{i} v_{0}^{j} c_{6}^{k} \beta^{\ell} \alpha_{1}^{\epsilon}\right) \doteq v_{2}^{i-1} v_{0}^{j} c_{6}^{k} \beta^{\ell} \alpha_{1}^{\epsilon} b_{4} \alpha_{2} \quad i \not \equiv 0 \quad \bmod 3
$$

for natural numbers $i, j, k, \ell$ and $\epsilon \in\{0,1\}$. There are no other differentials.

Consequently, this spectral sequence is periodic on the element $v_{2}^{3}$.

Remark 4.4. It would be nice to have an argument for this differential from first principles, but the author is not currently aware of one. He suspects this implies the existence of an interesting coproduct on $H_{*}$ tmf.
4.2. algebraic $E_{\infty}$-term. We will now describe a few patterns which make up the $E_{\infty}$-page of the algebraic spectral sequence. We will describe these patterns as certain modules over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ along with the monomial of the algebraic spectral sequence which generates it.
(Pattern 1) Since $v_{2}^{3}$ is a permanent cycle, we have the free $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ modules on the powers of $v_{2}^{3}$ and the $v_{2}^{3}$-multiples of $v_{2}^{2} b_{4}$, i.e. for all $j \geq 0$,

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{3 j}, v_{2}^{3 j-1} b_{4}\right\} ;
$$

(Pattern 2) For $j \equiv 0,1 \bmod 3$, we have the patterns

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{j} b_{4}\right\}
$$

(Pattern 3) For $j \not \equiv 0 \bmod 3$, we have the following patterns

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0} v_{2}^{j}\right\} \oplus \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}, v_{0}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{j} \alpha_{2}\right\}
$$

[^0]The way we obtained these patterns was by noting that, as a module over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, the $E_{1}$-page of the algebraic spectral sequence is freely generated by the monomials $v_{2}^{j} b_{4}^{\epsilon}$. In other words, we have an isomorphism of $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$-modules,

$$
E_{1} \cong \bigoplus_{j \geq 0, \varepsilon \in\{0,1\}} \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{j} b_{4}^{\varepsilon}\right\}
$$

The three patterns arise by partitioning the free modules $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. $\left\{v_{2}^{j} b_{4}^{\epsilon}\right\}$ into those which neither receive nor support any differentials (Pattern 1), receive differentials (Pattern 2), or support differentials (Pattern 3).

Remark 4.5. In later parts of this paper we will need to refer to these patterns. We will refer to them as patterns of type $j$ on generator $x$. So for example, if we look at the pattern on the Adams $E_{2}$-term generated by the monomial $v_{2}^{4} b_{4}$, then we will call this a pattern of type 2 on generator $v_{2}^{4} b_{4}$. For patterns of the third type, we will call these patterns of type 3 on generator $v_{2}^{j}$. This is potentially confusing since $v_{2}^{j}$ does not survive the algebraic spectral sequence unless $j$ is a multiple of 3 . This terminology stems from the fact that this pattern is the residual piece of a free $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$-module generated by $v_{2}^{j}$.


Figure 4.2. A depiction of pattern 2 on a generator $x$


Figure 4.3. A depiction of pattern 3 on a generator $x$
4.3. algebraic hidden extensions. As with any spectral sequence, there is the possibility of extension problems. We will show that there is a crucial hidden $v_{0}$-extension which will play an important role in the next section. Namely,
Proposition 4.6. In the algebraic spectral sequence, there is a hidden multiplicative extension

$$
v_{0} \cdot\left(v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}\right) \doteq v_{2} b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1}
$$

consequently for every natural number $j$ and $k$, we have the hidden extension

$$
v_{0} \cdot v_{2}^{2} c_{6}^{j} \beta^{k} \alpha_{2} \doteq v_{2} c_{6}^{j+1} \beta^{k} b_{4} \alpha_{2} .
$$

Remark 4.7. One might protest that this is not a hidden extension since $v_{2} b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ is an element in the correct Adams filtration. However, from the perspective of the algebraic spectral sequence, $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$ has filtration 0 and $v_{2} b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{2}$ has filtration 1 . Since $v_{0}$ has filtration 0 , this is in fact a hidden extension.

Remark 4.8. The reason why we need to prove this hidden extension is because one can see, from the known computation of $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$, that there are differentials

$$
d_{2}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right) \doteq v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}
$$

and

$$
d_{2}\left(v_{0} b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right) \doteq b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1} .
$$

Since the Adams differentials are linear with respect to $v_{0}$, in order for for this to be consistent, we must have the claimed hidden extension.

Before proving this, we will need to show the following.
Lemma 4.9. In $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, there is the Massey product

$$
c_{6} \alpha_{1} \in\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle
$$

and there is zero indeterminacy.
To prove this, we need to recall May's Convergence theorem. The proof of this fact can be found as Theorem 4.1 of [7], but we will only be interested in the case of a three-fold Massey product. The variant we will use is Theorem 2.2.2 of [5].

Theorem 4.10 (May's Convergence Theorem). Let $\alpha_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}$ be elements of Ext such that the Massey product $\left\langle\alpha_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle$ is defined. For each $i$, let $a_{i}$ be a permanent cycle on the May $E_{r}$-page which detects $\alpha_{i}$. Suppose further that
(1) The Massey product $\left\langle a_{0}, a_{1}, a_{2}\right\rangle$ is defined on the $E_{r+1}$-page: there are $a_{01}$ and $a_{12}$ such that $d_{r}\left(a_{01}\right)=\overline{a_{0}} a_{1}$ and $d_{r}\left(a_{12}\right)=\overline{a_{1}} a_{2}$.
(2) If $(m, s, t)$ is the tri-degree of either $a_{01}$ or $a_{12}$, and for for any $m^{\prime} \geq m$ and $q$ such that $m^{\prime}-q<m-r$, the differential

$$
d_{q}: E_{q}^{m^{\prime}, s, t} \rightarrow E_{q}^{m^{\prime}-q+1, s+1, t}
$$

is zero.
Then the element $\overline{a_{01}} a_{3}+\overline{a_{0}} a_{12}$ is a permanent cycle and detects an element of $\left\langle\alpha_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle$.
Remark 4.11. The second condition in May's Convergence Theorem is often expressed by saying there are no "crossing differentials."

We will use May's convergence theorem to give a proof for Lemma 4.9. Before doing so, it is helpful to recall the May spectral sequence for $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. This spectral sequence is obtained by putting a filtration on

$$
A(1)_{*}=P\left(\zeta_{1}\right) /\left(\zeta_{1}^{3}\right) \otimes E\left(\bar{\tau}_{0}, \bar{\tau}_{1}\right)
$$

is obtained by giving the generators of $A(1)_{*}$ the following May filtration

- $M F\left(\bar{\tau}_{0}\right)=M F\left(\zeta_{1}\right)=1$,
- $M F\left(\bar{\tau}_{1}\right)=3$.

This produces a filtration on the cobar complex for $A(1)_{*}$, resulting in the May spectral sequence

$$
E_{1}^{m, s, t} \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}^{s, t}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right),
$$

with the following $E_{1}$-term,

$$
E_{1} \cong E\left(\alpha_{1}\right) \otimes P\left(v_{0}, v_{1}, \beta\right)
$$

The coproduct on $A(1)_{*}$ gives the $d_{1}$-differential

$$
d_{1}\left(v_{1}\right)=v_{0} \alpha_{1} .
$$

The rest of the $d_{1}$-differentials are propagated from this one and the multiplicativity of the May spectral sequence. This makes the class $\alpha_{2}:=v_{1} \alpha_{1}$ a non-zero permanent cycle. One easily shows that

Lemma 4.12. In $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, there is the Massey product

$$
\alpha_{2}=\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle .
$$

Proof of Lemma 4.9 Since $\alpha_{1}$ is exterior on the May $E_{1}$-page, we get the following defining system $d_{1}\left(v_{1}^{2}\right)=\overline{v_{0}} \alpha_{2}$ and $d_{1}(0)=\alpha_{2}^{2}$ for the Massey product $\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle$.

Since $\alpha_{2}^{2}=0$ and $v_{0} \alpha_{2}=0$ in $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, the Massey product $\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle$ is defined in $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. Furthermore, there is no indeterminacy of this Massey product. So we just need to check the second condition of May's Convergence Theorem, that there are no crossing differentials. Note that $v_{1}^{2} \in E_{1}^{6,2,10}$ and that $E_{2}^{m, 2,10}=0$ for all $m$. So condition (2) is satisfied here. Likewise, note that $\left(v_{1} \alpha_{1}\right)^{2} \in E_{1}^{8,4,18}$ and that $E_{1}^{m, 3,18}=0$ for all $m$. Thus there are no nonzero differentials to worry about. So condition (2) is always satisfied here as well. Thus we may apply May's Convergence Theorem to infer that

$$
c_{6} \alpha_{1} \in\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle
$$

It is easy to see that there is no indeterminacy.
Remark 4.13. Keep in mind that May's convergence theorem is actually very general (cf. the discussion preceeding [8, A1.4.10]). It applies to any spectral sequence which arises from a multiplicative filtration on a DGA. In particular, it applies to the Cartan-Eilenberg SS and the algebraic SS we have used. Since the Cartan-Eilenberg SS collapses, and since the algebraic $S S$ only has $d_{1}$-differentials, the May Convergence Theorem vacuously applies to these spectral sequences.

Thus, we derive the following corollary.
Corollary 4.14. In $\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}\left(H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}\right)$ there is the Massey

$$
c_{6} \alpha_{1}=\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle
$$

We will use this corollary to derive the hidden multiplicative extension.

Proof of Proposition 4.6 One can check, using the May Convergence Theorem applied to the algebraic spectral sequence, that one has the Massey product

$$
v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2} \in\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4} v_{2}\right\rangle
$$

and that this Massey product has no indeterminacy. In order to apply the May Convergence Theorem to this Massey product, we must check that it is defined on $\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}}(\operatorname{tmf})$. Note that $\alpha_{2}^{2}=0$ in this Ext group, since there is no nonzero group in the 14 stem. Furthermore, since hidden extensions must always target a class in higher filtration, and since the algebraic spectral sequence only has elements in filtration 0 and 1, it follows that there can be no hidden extension for the product of $b_{4} v_{2}$ and $\alpha_{2}$. Thus the Massey product is defined in Ext $(\mathrm{tmf})$ (cf. Remark 4.13). Using the First Juggling Theorem (cf. [8, A1.4.6]), we have

$$
v_{0} \cdot\left(v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}\right)=v_{0}\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4} v_{2}\right\rangle \doteq\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle b_{4} v_{2}=c_{6} \alpha_{1} b_{4} v_{2}
$$

yielding the desired extension.
We will also have occasion to use the following hidden extension.
Corollary 4.15. In the algebraic SS, there is the Massey product

$$
v_{2} \alpha_{2}=\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4}\right\rangle
$$

and consequently the hidden extension

$$
v_{0} \cdot\left(v_{2} \alpha_{2}\right) \doteq b_{4} \cdot\left(c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right)
$$

Proof. A defining system for the Massey product $\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4}\right\rangle$ on the $E_{2}$ page is given by $d_{1}(0)=\alpha_{2}^{2}$ and $d_{1}\left(v_{2}\right)=\alpha_{2} b_{4}$. Observe that there is no indeterminacy. So by May's convergence theorem we have the Massey product

$$
v_{2} \alpha_{2} \doteq\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4}\right\rangle .
$$

Since this Massey product and $\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle$ are both strictly defined, we get from the First Juggling Theorem [8, A1.4.6(c)] the following equalities

$$
b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1}=\left\langle v_{0}, \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}\right\rangle b_{4}=v_{0}\left\langle\alpha_{2}, \alpha_{2}, b_{4}\right\rangle=v_{0}\left(v_{2} \alpha_{2}\right) .
$$

4.4. comparison to the Adams spectral sequence in tmf-modules. We now make a few remarks comparing the $E_{2}$-term of the Adams spectral sequence for tmf and the Adams spectral sequence for tmf in tmf-modules as studied by Hill ([4]). The latter is a spectral sequence

$$
E_{2}^{s, t}=\operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}^{s, t m f}}^{s, t}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \Longrightarrow \pi_{t-s} \operatorname{tmf}
$$

where

$$
A_{*}^{\mathrm{tmf}}=\pi_{*}\left(H \wedge_{\mathrm{tmf}} H\right) \cong A(1)_{*} \otimes E\left(a_{2}\right)
$$

where $a_{2}$ is in degeree 9 . This class has an interesting coproduct, but this does not concern us here. What is interesting for us, however, is that in order to compute this coproduct, Hill filters $A_{*}^{\text {tmf }}$, resulting in an algebraic spectral sequence

$$
E_{1}=\operatorname{Ext}_{E_{0} A_{*}^{\operatorname{tmf}}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \Longrightarrow \operatorname{Ext}_{A_{*}^{\operatorname{tmf}}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)
$$

One easily derives that

$$
E_{1}=\operatorname{Ext}_{E_{0} A_{*}^{\operatorname{mf}}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cong \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \otimes P\left(\widetilde{c_{4}}\right)
$$

where $\widetilde{c_{4}}$ is the class represented in the cobar complex of $E_{0} A^{t} m f_{*}$ by $\left[a_{2}\right]$. In particular, $\widetilde{c_{4}} \in E_{1}^{1,9}$. It turns out that this $E_{1}$-page is isomorphic to the $E_{1}$-term of our algebraic spectral sequence, but with various elements in ours in the "wrong" filtration. We provide a short dictionary relating various names in our spectral sequence to Hill's algebraic spectral sequence.

| alg'c SS | Hill's alg'c SS |
| :---: | :---: |
| $b_{4}$ | $\widetilde{c_{4}}$ |
| $v_{2}$ | ${\widetilde{c_{4}}}^{2}$ |
| $b_{4} v_{2}$ | ${\widetilde{c_{4}}}^{3}$ |
| $\vdots$ | $\vdots$ |

In particular, the element that Hill calls ${\widetilde{c_{4}}}^{2 \ell+\varepsilon}$ corresponds to the element we call $b_{4}^{\varepsilon} v_{2}^{\ell}$. Moreover, Hill is able to derive a differential $d_{1}\left(\widetilde{c_{4}}\right)=\alpha_{2}$. Algebraic manipulation then yields the following differentials $d_{2}\left(\alpha_{2} \widetilde{c}_{4}^{2}\right)=v_{1}^{3} \beta$ and $d_{2}\left(v_{0}{\widetilde{c_{4}}}^{2}\right)=v_{1}^{3} \alpha_{1}$. These all correspond to various differentials we encounter in this paper as well, but interestingly, not all of them are algebraic differentials. On the one hand, the differential $d_{1}\left(\widetilde{c_{4}}{ }^{2}\right)=\widetilde{c_{4}} \alpha_{2}$ corresponds to our algebraic differential $d_{1}\left(v_{2}\right)=b_{4} \alpha_{2}$. But the differential $d_{1}\left(\widetilde{c_{4}}\right)=\alpha_{2}$ corresponds to an Adams $d_{2}$-differential $d_{2}\left(b_{4}\right)=\alpha_{2}$.

In particular, half of Hill's algebraic differentials are seen in our algebraic spectral sequence, but the other half arise as Adams differentials. It is this discrepancy that makes the tmf-relative Adams spectral sequence more computable as opposed to the absolute Adams spectral sequence.

## 5. AdAMS DIFFERENTIALS

In this section, we will determine the differentials in the Adams spectral sequence for tmf. Since tmf is a commutative ring spectrum, the Adams spectral sequence is multiplicative. Begin by noting that there are several classes which are permanent cycles for degree reasons.

Lemma 5.1. The classes $v_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta$, and $c_{6}$ are all permanent cycles for the Adams spectral sequence. Consequently, the differentials in the Adams spectral sequence are linear over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1) *}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$.

This observation is very useful for our calculation for the following reason. In the last section, we have expressed the Adams $E_{2^{-}}$ term as a direct sum of certain patterns which were modules over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. This observation implies that the only nonzero differentials in the Adams spectral sequence will originate on the monomials which generate these patterns. We will also make frequent use of the following facts about $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$.

Theorem 5.2 (cf. [3]). The homotopy groups of tmf are 72 periodic. Furthermore, the torsion in $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$ is concentrated in stems $3,10,13,20$, $27,30,37$, and 40 modulo 72.

We will begin by determining all of the length 2 differentials first.
5.1. Adams $d_{2}$-differentials. As was mentioned previously, the Adams differentials are all linear over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$, which means we only have to figure which of the following families of monomials support Adams $d_{2}$-differentials: For any natural number $j$
(1) $v_{2}^{3 j}$,
(2) $v_{2}^{j} b_{4}$,
(3) $v_{0} v_{2}^{j}$ for $j \equiv 1,2 \bmod 3$, and
(4) $v_{2}^{j} \alpha_{2}$ for $j \equiv 1,2 \bmod 3$.

From our charts, one sees that $v_{2}^{3}$ can support a length 3 differential at minimum. Thus, $v_{2}^{3 j}$ is a $d_{2}$-cycle for all $j$. Moreover, there are
several multiplicative relations on the Adams $E_{2}$-term which we get from the previous section. For example, we have $v_{2}^{3} \cdot\left(v_{2} b_{4}\right)=v_{2}^{4} b_{4}$. Consequently, we have

Proposition 5.3. The Adams $d_{2}$-differentials for $\operatorname{tmf}$ are linear over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \otimes$ $P\left(v_{2}^{3}\right)$. Thus, we only need to determine which of the monomials $b_{4}, v_{0} v_{2}$, $v_{2} \alpha_{2}, b_{4} v_{2}, v_{0} v_{2}^{2}, v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$, and $b_{4} v_{2}^{2}$ support $d_{2}$-differentials.
Corollary 5.4. The Adams $E_{3}$-term is periodic on $v_{2}^{3}$.
Proposition 5.5. There is an Adams $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(b_{4}\right) \doteq \alpha_{2} \tag{5.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof 1. From the known computation of $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$, it is seen that $\pi_{7} \mathrm{tmf}=$ 0 . Thus, the class $\alpha_{2}$ must die. The only possibility is the claimed differential.

Proof 2. Recall that in the Adams $E_{2}$-term for tmf, we have the Massey product

$$
\beta=\left\langle\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle
$$

In the Adams spectral sequence for the sphere, there is the same Toda bracket. This is because, $\alpha_{1}$ and $\beta$ are the Hurewicz images of the classes of the same name in the homotopy groups of $S^{0}$. This can be seen by considering the induced map on $E_{2}$-terms

$$
\operatorname{Ext}\left(S^{0}\right) \rightarrow \operatorname{Ext}(\operatorname{tmf})
$$

and using cobar representatives. It is known from the Adams spectral sequence for the sphere that there is a $d_{2}$-differential whose target is $v_{0} \beta$ (cf. [8]). In particular, this forces $v_{0} \beta=0$ in $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$. This forces the Adams differential

$$
d_{2}\left(b_{4} \alpha_{1}\right) \doteq v_{0} \beta=\alpha_{1} \alpha_{2} .
$$

However, as $\alpha_{1}$ is a permanent cycle for the ASS for tmf, we must have that

$$
d_{2}\left(b_{4}\right) \doteq \alpha_{2}
$$

as stated.
Remark 5.7. This is one of the Adams differentials which occurs as an algebraic differential in [4].

We can draw an interesting consequence from the second argument provided above (we learned this from Mike Hill and Mark Behrens).

Corollary 5.8. The element $b_{4} \alpha_{1}$ is the image of $h_{1} \in \operatorname{Ext}\left(S^{0}\right)$ under the map

$$
\operatorname{Ext}\left(S^{0}\right) \rightarrow \operatorname{Ext}(\operatorname{tmf})
$$

and consequently we have the hidden comodule extension in $H_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$,

$$
\alpha\left(\zeta_{1}^{3}\right)=\zeta_{1}^{3} \otimes 1-\zeta_{1} \otimes b_{4}+1 \otimes \zeta_{1}^{3}
$$

Proof. In the Adams spectral sequence for the sphere, it is the class $h_{1}$ which supports a $d_{2}$-differential killing $v_{0} \beta$. Naturality of the Adams spectral sequence implies that $h_{1}$ maps to $b_{4} \alpha_{1}$.

In the cobar complex for $S^{0}$, the element $h_{1}$ is represented by $\zeta_{1}^{3}$. On the other hand, we have represented $b_{4} \alpha_{1}$ in the cobar complex by $\left[\zeta_{1}\right] b_{4}$. Thus there must be an element of $H_{*} \operatorname{tmf}$ which bounds the difference between $\left[\zeta_{1}^{3}\right]$ and $\left[\zeta_{1}\right] b_{4}$. The only possibility is

$$
d\left([] \zeta_{1}^{3}\right)=\left[\zeta_{1}^{3}\right]-\left[\zeta_{1}\right] b_{4}
$$

This implies the claimed coaction.
Proposition 5.9. There is an Adams $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(v_{0} v_{2}\right) \doteq c_{6} \alpha_{1} . \tag{5.10}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof 1. It is known that $\pi_{15}(\mathrm{tmf})=0$. The only nonzero class in this stem on the Adams $E_{2}$-term for $\operatorname{tmf}$ is $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$. Thus, this class must die. The only possibility is the claimed differential.

Proof 2. We provide a second proof which does not rely on a priori knowledge of $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$. Recall the Massey product for $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ we found in Corollary 4.14. Since $\alpha_{2}$ projects to 0 on the $E_{3}$-page, we have that the Massey product projects to 0 at $E_{3}$. One also checks that the indeterminacy for this Massey product on $E_{3}$ is 0 . It is also the case that there is no room for crossing differentials in this range. Thus Moss' Convergence Theorem implies that $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ must project to 0 in $E_{\infty}$. This implies that $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ must be killed by a $d_{2}$-differential. The only possibility is the claimed differential.

One would like to conclude from this that there is a length 2 differential from $b_{4} v_{2}$ to $v_{2} \alpha_{2}$. However, one must be cautious. Even though $b_{4} v_{2}$ was a product in the $E_{1}$-term of the algebraic spectral sequence of the last section, it is no longer decomposable (as $v_{2}$ supported an algebraic differential). In fact, this differential does not occur. As explained in subsection 4.4, the classes $b_{4}$ and $v_{2}$
correspond to Hill's classes $\widetilde{c_{4}}$ and ${\widetilde{c_{4}}}^{2}$ respectively. Also, $b_{4} v_{2}$ corresponds to $\Delta$, the modular discriminant. In any of the computations for $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$, there is a differential $d_{?}(\Delta)=\alpha_{1} \beta^{2}$. This suggests that $b_{4} v_{2}$ ought to support a length 3 differential to $\alpha_{1} \beta^{2}$. On the other hand, $\pi_{23} \operatorname{tmf}=0$, and on $E_{2}(\operatorname{tmf})$, there are the nonzero classes $v_{2} \alpha_{2}, \alpha_{1} \beta^{2}$, and $b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1}$. Also, Proposition 5.5 implies that $d_{2}\left(c_{6} b_{4} \alpha_{1}\right)=c_{6} \alpha_{1} \alpha_{2}$, taking care of the class $c_{6} b_{4} \alpha_{1}$. This suggests that $v_{2} \alpha_{2}$ will support a differential.

Proposition 5.11. In $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$, one has that $c_{6} \beta=0$. Consequently, there is an Adams $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(v_{2} \alpha_{2}\right) \doteq c_{6} \beta . \tag{5.12}
\end{equation*}
$$

We give two proofs.
Proof 1. By the previous proposition, we can form the Massey product $\left\langle c_{6}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle_{E_{3}}$ on the $E_{3}$-page. By the juggling lemma, [8, Appendix 1], we have that

$$
c_{6} \beta=c_{6}\left\langle\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle=\left\langle c_{6}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle \alpha_{1} .
$$

From the previous proposition, we infer that the Massey product $\left\langle c_{6}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle$ contains 0 . It is also easy to see that this Massey product has zero indeterminacy. Thus $c_{6} \beta=0$ in $E_{3}(\operatorname{tmf})$. Thus $c_{6} \beta$ must be the target of a $d_{2}$-differential. The only possible source is $v_{2} \alpha_{2}$.

Proof 2. From Proposition 5.5, we deduce that

$$
d_{2}\left(b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right)=c_{6} \alpha_{1} \alpha_{2}=v_{0} c_{6} \beta
$$

The hidden extension 4.15 then implies the stated differential.
The next monomials we need to consider are $b_{4} v_{2}, v_{0} v_{2}^{2}$, and $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$, in that order. By inspection of the chart, each of these classes have only one possible target on the $E_{2}$-page. However, one finds from the previous propositions that each of these potential targets actually supports a differential. Thus $b_{4} v_{2}, v_{0} v_{2}^{2}$, and $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$ are $d_{2}$-cycles. Thus we move on to the monomial $b_{4} v_{2}^{2}$.

Proposition 5.13. There is a $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right) \doteq v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2} \tag{5.14}
\end{equation*}
$$

as well as the $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(v_{0} b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right) \doteq v_{2} c_{6} b_{4} \alpha_{1} \tag{5.15}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof 1. It is known that $\pi_{39}$ tmf is zero (cf. [1,9]), but on the $E_{2}$-term, there are the nonzero classes $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$ and $v_{2} c_{6} b_{4} \alpha_{1}$ which are not killed by previously established $d_{2}$-differentials. The only way for $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$ to be killed is by a $d_{2}$-differential given by the claimed differential. The hidden $v_{0}$-extension established in Proposition 4.6 gives us the second differential.

Proof 2. We have already established the differential $d_{2}\left(v_{0} v_{2}\right)=c_{6} \alpha_{1}$. Since $v_{2} b_{4}$ is a $d_{2}$-cycle, we have that

$$
d_{2}\left(\left(v_{0} v_{2}\right) v_{2} b_{4}\right)=v_{2} b_{4} c_{6} \alpha_{1} .
$$

However, in the algebraic spectral sequence, we had the relation

$$
\left(v_{0} v_{2}\right) v_{2} b_{4}=v_{0}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right)
$$

The multiplicativity of the spectral sequence and the hidden extension Proposition 4.6 implies the differential $d_{2}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right)=v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$.

We can draw from this differential another $d_{2}$-differential.
Corollary 5.16. There is the following $d_{2}$-differential

$$
\begin{equation*}
d_{2}\left(v_{2}^{2} b_{4} \alpha_{2}\right) \doteq v_{2} c_{6} b_{4} \beta \tag{5.17}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. From the previous proposition we deduce the differential

$$
d_{2}\left(v_{2}^{2} b_{4} \beta\right) \doteq v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2} \beta
$$

However, we have from Proposition 4.6 that

$$
v_{0}\left(v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2} \beta\right) \doteq c_{6} b_{4} v_{2} \beta \alpha_{1}
$$

This implies the differential

$$
d_{2}\left(v_{2}^{2} v_{0} b_{4} \beta\right) \doteq c_{6} b_{4} v_{2} \beta \alpha_{1} .
$$

However, we also have

$$
v_{2}^{2} v_{0} b_{4} \beta=\left(v_{2}^{2} b_{4} \alpha_{2}\right) \cdot \alpha_{1} .
$$

Since $\alpha_{1}$ is a permanent cycle, multiplicativity of the spectral sequence implies the claimed differential.

This completes the determination of the Adams $d_{2}$-differential. Below, in Figure 5.1, we depict that Adams $E_{2}$-term along with the $d_{2}$-differentials. The reader will notice that we have use several different colors in the chart. Here is a key to the use of these colors.

| Color | Pattern | generator |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| black | pattern 1 | 1 |
| blue | pattern 2 | $b 4$ |
| lime green | pattern 3 | $v_{2}$ |
| dark magenta | pattern 2 | $v_{2} b_{4}$ |
| lavender rose | pattern 3 | $v_{2}^{2}$ |
| teal | pattern 1 | $v_{2}^{2} b_{4}$ |
| sea green | pattern 1 | $v_{2}^{3}$ |
| maroon | pattern 2 | $v_{2}^{3} b_{4}$ |
| dark violet | pattern 3 | $v_{2}^{4}$ |
| blue gray | pattern 2 | $v_{2}^{4} b_{4}$ |.

Before proceeding onto computing the $d_{3}$-differentials, we will give a description of the Adams $E_{3}$-term based on the differentials we just found.
5.2. Determining the Adams $E_{3}$-term. We now set out to determine the patterns that make up the Adams $E_{3}$-term for tmf. To get things going, first note that the pattern of type 2 on generator $b_{4}$ and the pattern of type 3 on generator $v_{2}$ support differentials into the pattern $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cdot\{1\}$ (see Remark 4.5 for an explanation of this terminology). More specifically, the differential (5.6) propagates to give the following $d_{2}$-differentials for $k, j, \ell \in \mathbb{N}$ and $\varepsilon_{1} \in\{0,1\}$;

$$
d_{2}\left(v_{0}^{\ell} c_{6}^{j} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}} \beta^{k} b_{4}\right) \doteq \begin{cases}c_{6}^{j} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}} \alpha_{2} \beta^{k} & \ell=0 \\ 0 & \ell \neq 0\end{cases}
$$

Similarly, the differentials (5.10) and (5.12) respectively propagate to give the differentials

$$
d_{2}\left(c_{6}^{j} v_{0}^{\ell} \cdot\left(v_{0} v_{2}\right)\right) \doteq \begin{cases}c_{6}^{j+1} \alpha_{1} & \ell=0 \\ 0 & \ell \neq 0\end{cases}
$$

and

$$
d_{2}\left(c_{6}^{j} \beta^{k} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}} \cdot\left(v_{2} \alpha_{2}\right)\right) \doteq c_{6}^{j+1} \beta^{k+1} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}}
$$

Observe that any monomial in $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ involving an $\alpha_{2}$ or a $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ is hit by a differential. So from $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ we obtain the module

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}, c_{6} \beta, c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right) \cdot\{1\} .
$$

The patterns supported by $b_{4}$ and $v_{2}$ do not receive any Adams $d_{2}$-differentials, so all we must do is determine what remains of these patterns after applying the Adams $d_{2}$-differentials. It follows


Figure 5.1. Adams $E_{2}$-page in stems $0-80$ with $d_{2^{-}}$ differentials
from these differentials that what remains of the pattern on $b_{4}$ is the submodule

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0} b_{4}\right\}
$$

and what remains of the pattern on $v_{2}$ is

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0}^{2} v_{2}\right\}
$$

The next pattern we need to consider is the pattern of type 2 on $b_{4} v_{2}$. Since $b_{4} v_{2}$ is a $d_{2}$-cycle, this entire pattern consists of $d_{2}$-cycles. Because of the hidden $v_{0}$-extension in Prop 4.6, we will consider this pattern in tandem with the half of the pattern of type 3 on $v_{2}^{2}$ generated by $v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}$. This half also consists only of $d_{2}$-cycles. Thus, the combined pattern only receives differentials. It receives its differentials from the free pattern $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{2} b_{4}\right\}$. The differentials (5.14), (5.15), and (5.17) propagate to give the following differentials:

$$
\begin{aligned}
d_{2}\left(v_{0}^{j} c_{6}^{k} \beta^{\ell} \alpha_{1}^{\epsilon_{1}} \cdot\left(v_{2}^{2} b_{4}\right)\right) & \doteq \begin{cases}c_{6}^{k} \beta^{\ell} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}} \cdot\left(v_{2}^{2} \alpha_{2}\right) & j=0 \\
c_{6}^{k+1} \beta^{\ell} \alpha_{1} \cdot\left(v_{2} b_{4}\right) & j=1, \varepsilon_{1}=0 \\
0 & \text { else }\end{cases} \\
d_{2}\left(c_{6}^{k} \beta^{\ell}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right) \cdot \alpha_{2}\right) & \doteq c_{6}^{k+1} \beta^{\ell+1}\left(v_{2} b_{4}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Note that any monomial in the pattern $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}\right) \cdot\left\{b_{4} v_{2}\right\}$ which contains a $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ or $c_{6} \beta$ is hit by a differential. Hence, this pattern yields the following module

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1) *}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}, c_{6} \beta, c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right) \cdot\left\{b_{4} v_{2}\right\} .
$$

It also follows that what remains of the pattern on $b_{4} v_{2}^{2}$ is the submodule

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}} /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{2} b_{4}\right\} .
$$

The other half of pattern 3 on $v_{2}$, i.e. $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0} v_{2}^{2}\right\}$, consists entirely of $d_{2}$-cycles and receives no differentials. Thus this survives in full to the $E_{3}$-page.

As we have already mentioned, the Adams $E_{3}$-term for tmf is periodic on $v_{2}^{3}$. Combining all of these observations proves the following identification of the Adams $E_{3}$-term.

Proposition 5.18. The Adams $E_{3}$-term is given as a module over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$ as the infinite direct sum of the following types of modules, Pattern 1' For all natural numbers $j$, we have the modules

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}, c_{6} \beta, c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right) \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{3 j}, v_{2}^{3 j+1} b_{4}\right\}
$$

Pattern 2' For all natural numbers $j$, we have the modules

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0} v_{2}^{3 j} b_{4}, v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{3 j+1}, v_{0} v_{2}^{3 j+2}, v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{3 j+2} b_{4}\right\},
$$

and the ring structure is inherited from the Adams $E_{2}$-term.
We give the Adams chart for the $E_{3}$-term below in Figure 5.2 ,
As we will see later, $v_{0} b_{4}$ will detect the class $c_{4}$. Similarly, the class $v_{0}^{2} v_{2}$ will detect $c_{4}^{2}$. On the other hand, there are certain important classes in the Adams-Novikov spectral sequence which support differentials. Namely, the class $\Delta$. In the ASS, the class $v_{2} b_{4}$ corresponds to $\Delta$ while the class $v_{2}^{3}$ corresponds to $\Delta^{2}$. The reader should note that, at the $E_{3}$-page, we do not have that $\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{2}\right)^{2}=v_{2}^{9}$. In fact, $b_{4} v_{2}^{2}$ is not in the correct filtration for this to happen. This, in fact, is what makes the Adams spectral sequence more difficult than the analogous calculation in [4]. However, since $\pi_{*}$ tmf is periodic on $\Delta^{3}$, this does suggest re-expressing the $E_{3}$-term in the following way. Let $M$ denote the $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$-module

$$
\begin{align*}
M: & =\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{2}, c_{6} \beta, c_{6} \alpha_{1}\right) \cdot\left\{1, v_{2} b_{4}, v_{2}^{3}\right\}  \tag{5.19}\\
& \oplus \operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right) /\left(\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{2}, \beta\right) \cdot\left\{v_{0} b_{4}, v_{0}^{2} v_{2}, v_{0} v_{2}^{2}, v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{2} b_{4}, v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{4}\right\} .
\end{align*}
$$

The following now follows from the previous proposition.
Corollary 5.20. There is an isomorphism of $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$-modules

$$
\begin{equation*}
E_{3}(\operatorname{tmf}) \cong \bigoplus_{k \geq 0} M \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{9 k}\right\} \oplus \bigoplus_{j \geq 0} M \cdot\left\{b_{4} v_{2}^{9 j+4}\right\} \tag{5.21}
\end{equation*}
$$

Remark 5.22. We will see that the classes $v_{2}^{9 j}$ detect the powers of $\Delta$ whose powers are congruent to 0 modulo 6 , while the classes $b_{4} v_{2}^{9 j+4}$ detect the powers of $\Delta$ whose powers are congruent to 3 modulo 6 .

At this point the Adams $E_{3}$-term isomorphic to "isomorphic" to the Adams-Novikov $E_{2}$-term but with te elements in the "wrong" filtrations. All of the later differentials correspond to the usual differentials in the Adams-Novikov spectral sequence, and in fact we could deduce them from that spectral sequence. However, we will try and provide several arguments from first principles below.


Figure 5.2. Adams $E_{3}$-page in stems $0-80$
5.3. Higher Adams differentials. The Adams $E_{3}$-term for tmf is much sparser than the $E_{2}$-term. This greatly reduces the possiblity of higher Adams differentials. We will now determine the $d_{3}$ and $d_{4}$ differentials in the Adams spectral sequence for tmf. Recall that the unit map

$$
S^{0} \rightarrow \mathrm{tmf}
$$

for tmf induces a map in Ext taking the class $\beta$ to $\beta$ and $\alpha_{1}$ to $\alpha_{1}$. This is used in the calculation [1] to derive higher Adams-Novikov differentials. We will also use it to derive higher Adams differentials.

Proposition 5.23. There is an Adams $d_{3}$-differential

$$
d_{3}\left(v_{2}^{3}\right) \doteq b_{4} v_{2} \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}
$$

Proof. It is know that $\pi_{47}(\mathrm{tmf})=0$. The only non-zero class in that stem on the $E_{3}$-term is $b_{4} v_{2} \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}$. This forces the stated differential.

Remark 5.24. The author has made attempts to give an argument for this differential from first principles. But as of the writing of this short article, he has been unable to find one.

Proposition 5.25. There is an Adams $d_{4}$-differential

$$
d_{4}\left(b_{4} v_{2}\right) \doteq \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}
$$

Proof. Since the classes $\alpha_{1}$ and $\beta$ are both in the Hurewicz image of tmf, so are all the monomials $\beta^{n} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon_{1}}$. In the stable homotopy of $S^{0}$, the class $\beta^{3} \alpha_{1}$ is zero. Since the corresponding class in $E_{3}(\operatorname{tmf})$ is not zero, it must be hit by a differential. The only possible class which could support a differential to $\beta^{3} \alpha_{1}$ is $b_{4} v_{2} \beta$. Thus we have the $d_{4}$-differential

$$
d_{4}\left(b_{4} v_{2} \beta\right) \doteq \beta^{3} \alpha_{1} .
$$

As the Adams differentials are linear over $\beta$, we infer

$$
d_{4}\left(b_{4} v_{2}\right) \doteq \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}
$$

Remark 5.26. Recall that $b_{4} v_{2}$ corresponds to the class $\Delta$ in the relative Adams spectral sequence (or in the Adams-Novikov spectral sequence). In particular, this differential corresponds to the $d_{2}$-differential $d_{2}(\Delta)=\alpha \beta^{2}$ in [4]. In that spectral sequence, this implies the differential $d_{2}\left(\Delta^{2}\right) \stackrel{\doteq}{\doteq} \alpha \beta^{2}$. However, in the ASS, the
class $b_{4} v_{2}$ squares to 0 , so we cannot establish such a $d_{2}$-differential. Rather it corresponds to the $d_{3}$-differential we established in Proposition 5.23 . It is interesting to note these $d_{2}$-differentials in the relative ASS get decoupled in the ASS.

Remark 5.27. One might like to think that there is the $d_{4}$-differential

$$
d_{4}\left(b_{4} v_{2}^{4}\right) \doteq v_{2}^{3} \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}
$$

because one can multiply the differential on $b_{4} v_{2}$ to get this differential. But this is not the case since $v_{2}^{3}$ supports a shorter differential. This is an important occurrence in this spectral sequence because $b_{4} v_{2}^{4}$ is detecting the class $\Delta^{3}$ and the homotopy groups of tmf are famously periodic on $\Delta^{3}$.

For degree reasons, these are the only possible $d_{3}$ and $d_{4}$ differentials. We will now produce the last differential in the Adams spectral sequence. In order to do that, we will need the following observation.

Lemma 5.28. The class $b:=b_{4} v_{2} \alpha_{1}$ is given on the $E_{5}$-page as the following Massey product

$$
b=\left\langle\beta^{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle
$$

Thus, by Moss' Convergence Theorem, the class $b$ in $\pi_{*} \mathrm{tmf}$ is given by the corresponding Toda bracket.

Proof. The differential $d_{4}(\Delta)=\beta^{2} \alpha_{1}$ gives a defining system for the Massey product on the $E_{5}$-page, and there is zero indeterminacy. Furthermore, the Toda bracket $\left\langle\beta^{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle$ is defined. Since there are no differentials up to the 30 stem after the $E_{4}$-page, there are no crossing differentials to worry about. So by Moss' convergence theorem, $b$ is given by the associated Toda bracket.
Proposition 5.29 (compare with [1]). There is the following hidden multiplicative extension in $\pi_{*}$ tmf,

$$
b \cdot \alpha_{1} \doteq \beta^{3} .
$$

Proof. Recall that $\beta$ is given by the Toda bracket $\left\langle\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle$. So, by the first juggling lemma (cf. [8, Appendix 1]), it follows that

$$
b \cdot \alpha_{1}=\left\langle\beta^{2}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle \alpha_{1}=\beta^{2}\left\langle\alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}, \alpha_{1}\right\rangle=\beta^{3}
$$

Corollary 5.30. The class $\beta^{5}$ is 0 in the homotopy groups of tmf. Thus, there is a $d_{6}$-differential

$$
d_{6}\left(v_{2}^{3} \alpha_{1}\right) \doteq \beta^{5}
$$

Proof. Using the multiplicative extension of the previous proposition, we have

$$
\beta^{5}=\beta^{2} \beta^{3}=\beta^{2} b \alpha_{1} .
$$

Since $\beta^{2} \alpha_{1}=0$, we have that $\beta^{5}=0$ in $\pi_{*}$ tmf. This forces the claimed differential.

We can now make the following observation.
Lemma 5.31. All differentials of length at least 3 established thus far respect the decomposition (5.21). That is, any differentials which are propagated from any of the previous differentials have as its source and target elements within the same copy of $M$. Furthermore, it follows for degree reasons that the pattern $M$ can support no other internal differentials.
Proof. As we have mentioned earlier, the Adams differentials are linear over $\operatorname{Ext}_{A(1)_{*}}\left(\mathbb{F}_{3}\right)$. So this follows because the differentials on the basis elements respect the decomposition.

The second part of this lemma asserts that any differentials of length at least 7 must be between distinct copies of $M$. Our next goal is to show that this cannot happen. Towards this end we will show that $b_{4} v_{2}^{2}$ and $v_{2}^{9}$ are permanent cycles.

Lemma 5.32. The class $b_{4} v_{2}^{4}$ is a permanent cycle.
Proof. The only possible differential that $b_{4} v_{2}^{4}$ could have supported was a $d_{4}$-differential to $v_{2}^{3} \beta \alpha_{1}$. But we have already shown that this class supports a $d_{6}$-differential.

Now we move on to showing $v_{2}^{9}$ is a permanent cycle.
Proposition 5.33. The class $v_{2}^{9}$ is a permanent cycle.
Proof. Begin by noticing that $v_{2}^{9}$ is a $d_{3}$-cycle. So the smallest length differential it could support is one of length at least four. Observe that all of the $v_{0}$-torsion free classes are in even degrees. As $v_{2}^{9}$ is in an even degree, it follows that $v_{2}^{9}$ cannot support a differential into a $v_{0}$-torsion free class. Thus, if $v_{2}^{9}$ is to support a differential, the target must be $v_{0}$-torsion. We see in the $E_{3}$-page that all of the
$v_{0}$-torsion is simple. Thus any differential supported by $v_{2}^{9}$ would have to have as its target a class of the form

$$
b_{4}^{\varepsilon} v_{2}^{j} \beta^{k} \alpha_{1}^{\varepsilon^{\prime}}
$$

where $j$ is congruent to 0 or 1 modulo 3 . This just follows from our computation of the Adams $E_{3}$-term for tmf. More specifically, all the $v_{0}$-torsion is concentrated in Pattern $1^{\prime}$. The $(t-s, s)$-bidegree of such elements is

$$
\left(12 j+10 n+3 \varepsilon^{\prime}+8 \varepsilon, j+2 n+\varepsilon^{\prime}\right)
$$

An elementary number theory argument on the bidegrees shows that the only possible targets of a differential supported by $v_{2}^{9}$ is $\beta^{14} \alpha_{1}$ or $v_{2}^{10} \beta^{2} \alpha_{1}$. Either way, $v_{2}^{9}$ would have to support a differential of length at least 6 to hit either of these classes. However, from previous propositions, both of these classes either support or are hit by a differential of length at most 6 . Thus $v_{2}^{9}$ cannot hit either of these classes, and hence must be a permanent cycle.

We can now derive that the Adams spectral sequence for tmf collapses at $E_{7}$. Towards this end, let $\bar{M}$ denote subquotient obtained from $M$ by incorporating the $d_{3}$ to $d_{6}$-differentials. Then we have the decomposition

$$
\begin{equation*}
E_{7}(\operatorname{tmf}) \cong \bigoplus_{k \geq 0} \bar{M} \cdot\left\{v_{2}^{9 k}\right\} \oplus \bigoplus_{j \geq 0} \bar{M} \cdot\left\{b_{4} v_{2}^{9 j+4}\right\} \tag{5.34}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proposition 5.35. The Adams spectral sequence for tmf collapses at $E_{7}$.
Proof. The direct sum decomposition (5.34) arises from the patterns $\bar{M} \cdot\{1\}$ and $\bar{M} \cdot\left\{b_{4} v_{2}^{4}\right\}$ and iteratively multiplying these two patterns by $v_{2}^{9}$. Since $b_{4} v_{2}^{4}$ and $v_{2}^{9}$ are permanent cycles, and since differentials of length at least 7 must be between distinct copies of $\bar{M}$, it follows that there are no further differentials. Consequently, the Adams spectral sequence collapses at $E_{7}$.

We provide the Adams $E_{3}$-term along with all higher differentials as well as a chart for the $E_{7}=E_{\infty}$-term below in Figures 5.3 and 5.4
5.4. Hidden extensions. In the previous subsection we showed that the Adams spectral sequence for $\operatorname{tmf}$ collapses at $E_{7}$ and we completely computed this page via (5.34). We've already established one hidden extension in Proposition 5.29, which corresponds to the


Figure 5.3. Adams $E_{3}$-page in stems $0-80$ with $d_{3}$ to $d_{6}$-differentials


Figure 5.4. Adams $E_{\infty}$-page in stems $0-80$
single hidden extension occurring in the Adams-Novikov spectral sequence for tmf .

However, there are several relations in $\pi_{*} \operatorname{tmf}$ which are apparent on the Adams-Novikov $E_{\infty}$-page appearing in the 0 -line, but which are hidden from the perspective of the Adams spectral sequence. We make several observations.

Lemma 5.36. The class $v_{0} b_{4}$ in $E_{\infty}$ detects the class $c_{4}$ in $\pi_{8} \mathrm{tmf}$. Similarly, $c_{6}$ detects the class of the corresponding name in $\pi_{12} \mathrm{tmf}$

Proof. These are the only classes in those degrees in the homotopy of tmf and in the $E_{\infty}$-page of the ASS.

Looking at our chart for $E_{\infty}$, we find that there is a single $v_{0}$ tower in the 16 -stem which is generated by $v_{0}^{2} v_{2}$. This implies the following,

Lemma 5.37. The class $v_{0}^{2} v_{2}$ detects the class $c_{4}^{2}$ in $\pi_{16} \mathrm{tmf}$ and we have the hidden extension $c_{4} \cdot c_{4} \doteq v_{0}^{2} v_{2}$.

We can also say which classes are detecting the various classes involving $\Delta$ in $\pi_{*}$ tmf. We will rename some classes in order to give more streamlined expressions. We will rename $b_{4} v_{2}$ by $v_{2}^{3 / 2}$. Thus, for example, the class $v_{2}^{9 / 2}$ refers to $b_{4} v_{2}^{4}$. We will use the expression $\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{k}$, when $k=2 \ell$, to mean $v_{2}^{3 \ell}$, while when $k=2 \ell+1$ this expression stands for $b_{4} v_{2} \cdot v_{2}^{3 \ell}=b_{4} v_{2}^{3 \ell+1}$. At the moment, we have introduced this notation more for convenience, it is not reflective of a multiplicative structure on any page of this spectral sequence. Indeed, on $E_{\infty}$, the square of $b_{4} v_{2}$ is 0 . However, this notation is motivated by a certain hidden extension which will appear shortly.

Note that from the results of the previous section, we have
Lemma 5.38. When $j \equiv 1,2 \bmod 3$, the classes $\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{j}$ support a differential, and in this case the classes $v_{0}\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{j}$ are permanent cycles.

We can determine what these classes detect in $\pi_{*}(\operatorname{tmf})$.
Corollary 5.39. For $j \equiv 1,2 \bmod 3$, the classes $v_{0}\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{j}$ detect $3 \Delta^{j}$. For $j \equiv 0 \bmod 3$, the class $\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{j}$ detects $\Delta^{j}$.

Because these correspond to multiples of powers of $\Delta$, this implies a family of hidden extensions.

Corollary 5.40. In $E_{\infty}$, we have the following hidden extensions for every $\ell \geq 0$,

$$
\left(v_{0} v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right) \cdot v_{0}\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{2 \ell+1}=v_{0}^{2} v_{2}^{3 \ell+3}
$$

We have the hidden extensions for odd $j$

$$
\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{3} \cdot\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{3 j}=\left(v_{2}^{3 / 2}\right)^{3(j+1)}
$$

This corollary justifies our choice of notation. Finally, the theory of modular forms tells us that there is the famous relation

$$
c_{4}^{3}-c_{6}^{2}=1728 \Delta=2^{3} 3^{3} \Delta .
$$

This implies a hidden extension in the $E_{\infty}$-term.
Lemma 5.41. There is a hidden extension in $E_{\infty}(t m f)$ given by

$$
c_{4} \cdot\left(v_{0}^{2} v_{2}\right) \doteq v_{0}^{3} b_{4} v_{2}+c_{6}^{2}
$$

These hidden extensions, of course, propagate themselves throughout the $E_{\infty}$-term. There are no hidden extensions beyond the ones mentioned above.

Remark 5.42. It is rather unsatisfying that the way these hidden extensions were determined by using the known multiplicative structure in $\pi_{*}$ tmf. It would be nice to have arguments from first principles. It would seem that this would require knowing Massey product descriptions of various classes, such as $c_{4}, v_{2}^{3 / 2}$, and so on. But the author was unable to find such descriptions.

## References

[1] Tilman Bauer, Computation of the homotopy of the spectrum tmf, Groups, homotopy and configuration spaces (Tokyo 2005) (2008Feb).
[2] Robert Bruner and John Rognes, The adams spectral sequence for topological modular forms. in preparation.
[3] André Henriques, The homotopy groups of tmf and of its localizations, Topological modular forms, 2014.
[4] Michael A. Hill, The 3-local tmf-homology of $B \Sigma_{3}$, Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society 135 (2007Dec), no. 12, 4075-4087.
[5] Daniel Isaksen, Stable stems. preprint.
[6] Mark Mahowald and Michael J. Hopkins, From elliptic curves to homotopy theory, Topological modular forms, 2014.
[7] J. Peter May, Matric Massey products, J. Algebra 12 (1969), 533-568. MR0238929
[8] Douglas C. Ravenel, Complex cobordism and stable homotopy groups of spheres, Pure and Applied Mathematics, vol. 121, Academic Press, Inc., Orlando, FL, 1986. MR860042
[9] Charles Rezk, Supplementary notes to math 512.

University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign
E-mail address: dculver@illinois.edu


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ The class $c_{6} \alpha_{1}$ will be dealt with by an Adams differential.

